

Interactive comment on “Application of Gamma functions to the determination of unit hydrographs” by Hongyan Li and Yangzong Cidan

Anonymous Referee #1

Received and published: 5 May 2020

Dear authors,

I applaud for your effort on the contribution, however I do not think that the overall manuscript is novel enough especially in hydrological science. In addition, the manuscript characteristics also lean towards 'technical note' instead of 'research article' status. I do find the writing style to be rather clear and not complicated.

From my understanding the paper focuses on the parameter optimisation of classic Collin's method in deriving UH. The author chose genetic algorithm for this optimisation purpose. Both of these methods are very well documented and long known in Hydrology, therefore the manuscript does not present anything novel.

Meanwhile I also think that the writing or presentation is not adequate, it contains a

Printer-friendly version

Discussion paper



lot of typos, content is not concise, bad quality figures and equations, and non-critical result presentations.

Herein, I have also attached the commented manuscript with few highlights of the mentioned. I would encourage the authors to try submitting to some technical note journals upon having the manuscript revised with a more concise and critical presentation.

Good luck.

Please also note the supplement to this comment:

<https://www.nonlin-processes-geophys-discuss.net/npg-2020-1/npg-2020-1-RC1-supplement.pdf>

Interactive comment on Nonlin. Processes Geophys. Discuss., <https://doi.org/10.5194/npg-2020-1>, 2020.

Printer-friendly version

Discussion paper

