Nonlinear Processes
in Geophysics

Discussions

EGU

# *Interactive comment on* "Regularization Destriping of Remote Sensing Imagery" *by* R. Basnayake et al.

K. McIlhany (Referee)

mcilhany@usna.edu

I found the paper interesting and relevant. There are numerous grammatical errors however which need to be addressed. There are enough that I simply scanned my edited copy for your perusal. My strong suggestion is that one of the writers read aloud the paper so that these mistakes are caught early on before submitting in the future. I realize that some of the authors are non-native English speakers and I am always impressed at how well they perform in the scientific environment, however, technical writing requires clarity. In some cases, the grammar issues lead to confusion about what exactly is being said.

On pages 4-5 there is come confusion in the text about whether the equations indicated boundary points as either "red" or "bold". Further, this confusion is present in table 1.

C1

The PDF file does not show "red" when it is indicated in table 1 but does show red in table 2. When printing the article in black and white, it is better to indicate these as bold, so perhaps they could be both red and bold and then everyone is happy. Also, on page 4 and 5 is repeated text, pick one and remove the other.

Overall, I enjoyed the paper and its content. I do have a few technical questions, but nothing to prevent publication.

1) Page 7: In seeking a minimum for the U-curve method, how many numerical attempts at alpha are reasonable? 2) Page 9: When the data contains a horizontal stripe, do you accidentally remove it (like a road) and if not, how do you know to avoid it? 3) Page 10: Why 12 for the threshold? How do you choose 12? A suggestion would be to turn Fig. 5 by 90 degs and then set the threshold to the FWHM of the highest peak found. You could repeat this process using the next lowest peak and see how many more stripes are found. Eventually, you will see a rise in the number of stripes found and then raise the threshold to an earlier value when the number of stripes found was more consistent. 4) When citing "inpainting" did you consider Andrea Bertozzi?

Most of my grammatical issues are highlighted in red ink on the attached PDF. I answered my own inquiries about the "argmin_u" and "vicarious" comments, so please disregard those, but the rest are genuine issues about writing.

Thank you for the opportunity to review your work,

Kevin Mcilhany

Please also note the supplement to this comment:
http://www.nonlin-processes-geophys-discuss.net/npg-2016-74/npg-2016-74-RC1-supplement.pdf