Review of "The Lagrange form of the nonlinear Schrodinger equation for low vorticity waves in deep water: rogue wave aspect" (revised) by Anatoly Abrashkin and Efim Pelinovsky

## **Editor Comment**

While the first referee is now satisfied, the second referee has reiterated a major issue which needs to be fully addressed in a further revision. I agree completely with the thrust of the referee's comment, and request that you revise accordingly.

The issue is the relationship between the derived nonlinear Schrodinger equation (NLS) (47) in Lagrangian coordinates and similar extant results in the literature expressed in Eulerian coordinates. Since you have assumed weak vorticity, and the NLS itself is a weakly nonlinear asymptotic expansion, the end result is a simply a phase change, which as the referee has pointed out, can be found in the literature in several places using the more usual Eulerian coordinates. This needs to be fully acknowledged, especially in your section 5, with a full set of appropriate references. I would add that the term "correlation" in the heading of this section would be more appropriately called "equivalnce". Also, as a relatively minor but nonetheless important point, reference to the work of "Benney and his group" needs an explicit reference(s), and finally the English expression can be improved.

1