

This paper deals with the problem of experimental excitation of edge waves when incident water waves propagate on a sloping sea bottom. Emphasis is put on the influence of breaking wave of edge wave generation. It is an interesting paper. My comments are the following: (i) To have more confidence in claims' authors, it should be more useful to use frequency spectra of the surface elevation, namely to demonstrate quantitatively the period doubling and edge wave suppression. Generally turbulent underlying flows attenuate or cancel water waves. So, it is not surprising that breaking waves which generate turbulence may suppress edge wave excitation. (ii) In equation (9) specify b^* (complex conjugate). (iii) In figure 1, plot axes z and y . (iv) What kind of wavemaker is used? (v) I assume that in figure 5 the solid lines fit the experimental data. (vi) The English must be improved.

,