Nonlin. Processes Geophys. Discuss., 2, C242–C244, 2015
www.nonlin-processes-geophys-discuss.net/2/C242/2015/
© Author(s) 2015. This work is distributed under
the Creative Commons Attribute 3.0 License.

Nonlinear Processes in Geophysics
Discussions
Open Access

Interactive comment on "Multivariate localization methods for ensemble Kalman filtering" *by* S. Roh et al.

Anonymous Referee #2

Received and published: 19 June 2015

To help the Editor assess the strength of my opinions on the following issues, I will also give an answer in terms of a scale from 1 to 5 with 1 being the strongest possible No and 5 being the strongest possible Yes.

1) General Information (select YES or NO)

Does the paper contain new and significant results?

Yes – but on a scale of 1 to 5 with 1 being significant and 5 being extremely significant, I would give it a 3.

Is the paper of an international standard?

Yes –but I would give it a 3.

Is the presentation clear and concise?

Yes – Not bad, I would give it a 4.

Does the paper put the obtained results into context, with relevant references?

Yes – Again quite good, I would give it a 4.

Is the length of the paper appropriate?

Yes – 4, although my review asks for an additional experiment which would lengthen the paper.

Is the text fluent and precise?

Yes – Mostly, a 4.

Are the title and the abstract pertinent and understandable to a wide audience?

Yes – I'd give it a 4. My only problem with the title is that "localization" seems like the wrong word for "attenuating" or "moderating" covariances between variables that exist at the same point in space. On the other word, "localization

Are all figures necessary, and of appropriate quality?

Yes – I'd give it a 3 because there are some figures (8-11) that are barely discussed in the text – I have mentioned this in my review.

2) Recommendation to the Editor

For final publication, the manuscript should be reconsidered after major revisions: I would be willing to review the paper again.

Please also note the supplement to this comment:
http://www.nonlin-processes-geophys-discuss.net/2/C242/2015/npgd-2-C242-2015-supplement.pdf