

Interactive comment on “Site effect classification based on microtremor data analysis using concentration–area fractal model” by A. Adib et al.

Anonymous Referee #1

Received and published: 25 August 2014

Cheng and Agterberg (1996), Sim et al (1999), Goncalves et al (2001) are not using classification method for more than 3 classes but detection tool for extreme data (2 classes, as shown in all plots of those articles). The article from Afzal et al. (2010) proposes to extend the Concentration-Area method to more than two classes without theoretical justification. More than a theoretical work, this article should point out at least a discussion about the justification for the case of more than 2 classes, in the framework of fractal/multifractal. Also the authors should state clearly that their use of the C-A method is extended from the initial version from Cheng et al., 1994.

Figure 3: the scale is still missing.

Figure 8: The points without names will improve the lisibility of the figure and the comparison with figure 9.

C415

Figure 9: The figure would be more easy to interpret in color using the same color legend than figure 8.

Reference: Afzal, P., Khakzad, A., Moarefvand, P., Rashidnejad Omran, N., Esfan-diari, B., Fadakar Alghalandis, Y., (2010). *Journal of Geochemical Exploration* 104, 34–46
Cheng, Q., Agterberg, F.P., Ballantyne, S.B., (1994). *Journal of Geochemical Exploration* 51, 109–130.
Cheng and Agterberg (1996), *Journal of Geochemical Exploration* 56, 183–195
Sim, B.L., Agterberg, F.P., Beaudry, C., (1999) *Computers & Geosciences* 25, 1023–1041.
Goncalves, Mario A., Mateus, Antonio, Oliveira, Vitor, (2001). *Journal of Geochemical Exploration* 72, 91–114.

Interactive comment on Nonlin. Processes Geophys. Discuss., 1, 1133, 2014.